

6. Appendix A: Reflective Ability Scoring Rubric

Reflection on Action Rubric				
Level (points)	Reflection Performance	Scoring Guidelines	Elaborated Guidelines	Examples
0	Does not respond to the assignment	Narrative is submitted but is not responsive to the topic or assignment.	Venting without description of a specific situation. Describing an encounter unrelated to the topic.	1. "Patients in this hospital are challenging to care for." 2. "You asked about this, but I'd rather tell you about something different."
1	Describes without reflecting	Narrative description of encounter but no evidence of reflection on action.	Very detailed story with some insight into behavior in the moment but no further discussion of behavior in retrospect.	"We took care of this patient, considered their needs, addressed their concerns and challenges, and did a good job."
2	Does not justify lessons learned	States that lessons were learned but without explicit linkage to supporting evidence.	Vague reference to lessons learned without elaboration. List of lessons learned without linkage to evidence. General platitudes about optimal care without specific linkage to scenario.	"I look care of a Cuban patient and became aware that it is important to consider their cultural background."
3	Provides limited justification of lessons learned	Relies on personal assessment of lessons learned.	Personal opinion about lessons learned predominates. Little or no inclusion of external evidence as defined below.	"I felt more confident about my skills and I expect the patient will check her blood sugars more frequently and return for her appointments."
4	Includes evidence of lessons learned	Includes external evidence of lessons learned.	External evidence includes detailed feedback from patients or professional associates, objective data on outcomes, and/or use of the literature	"I followed up and found that the patient returned to clinic, brought her glucose records, and had better glycemic control."
5	Analyzes factors from experience	Explicitly refers to prior experiences and describes how they inform own behavior in current situation.	Reference to prior experience can reinforce successful practices or inform a change in practice. Must meet criteria for level 4: even if analyzes factors from experience, cannot achieve this level without including external evidence of lessons learned.	"In the past I have approached similar patients by providing them with a monitoring sheet and not evaluating their literacy level. In this case I established that the patient had some English proficiency and used level-appropriate materials with him."
6	Integrates previous experience with current events and data to inform further action	Analysis including external evidence of lessons learned, relation to prior experience and implications for the future.	Must meet criteria for level 5 and also include a specific plan for the future including how success will be monitored.	"I will: assess English health literacy in all my Latino patients using the SAHLSA-50 form; request low literacy educational material for our clinic; determine success by tracking Latino patients screened and literacy forms in clinic in 3 months."

Patricia S. O'Sullivan, Louise Aronson, Eva Chittenden, Brian Niehaus, Lee A. Learman
 MedEdPORTAL Publications 01/2010; DOI: 10.15766/mep_2374-8265.8133